

**FFOS-Y-FRAN LIAISON COMMITTEE
MEETING No. 013
30 October 2008**

**Civic Centre, Merthyr Tydfil
APPROVED NOTES**

ATTENDEES:

Appointed Councillor Members	Office	Ward	Present
Cllr Julian Amos	Chair	Dowlais	YES
Cllr Tony Rogers		Dowlais	
Cllr Amy Kitcher	Deputy Chair	Town	YES
Cllr Robert Griffin		Town	YES
Cllr Derek Games		Plymouth	YES
Cllr Brent Carter		Plymouth	-
Cllr Leighton Smart		Bedlinog	-
Substitute Councillor Members			
Cllr Ray Thomas		Dowlais	-
Cllr Phil Williams		Dowlais	YES
Cllr Gareth Lewis		Town	-
Cllr Kurt Morgan		Town	-
Cllr Kevin O'Connor		Plymouth	-
Cllr Gareth Jones		Bedlinog	-
Caerphilly CBC			
Cllr David Hardacre		Caerphilly	-
MTCBC Officers			
Mr Norman Davies	Head of Planning		YES
Mr Dave Dier	Head of Public Health		YES
Ms Zoe Pieris	Principle Environmental Health Officer		YES
Environment Agency			
Mr Dave Griffiths			YES
Ms Laura Owen			
Mr John Harrison			-

Resident Members			
Mrs Alyson Austin		Bradley Gardens	YES
Mrs Mary Bradley		Fochriw	-
Mrs Jane Flower		Japonica	YES
Mr Lyn Humphries		Dowlais	YES
Mr Phillip Murphy		Caerharris	YES
Mr Alan Rees		Caedraw	YES
Mr Bill White		Dowlais	
Mr Ron Yandle		Mount View	
Miller Argent			
James T. Poyner	Director		YES
Stephen Tillman	Director		-
Robert Jones	Operations Manager		YES
Bob Edwards	DP Manager		YES
Kylie Jones	Environmental Liaison Officer		YES
Susan Allen	Secretary		YES
Elizabeth Verrinder	Archaeologist		YES
Invited Guests			
Jonathan Reeves	Environmental Agency		YES

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
-------------	-------------	---------------

Before the meeting commenced, for the benefit of the new committee members James Poyner gave a brief presentation on the Ffos-y-fran Land Reclamation Scheme

The Chair and the committee congratulated Cllr. Amy Kitcher on the birth of her baby daughter.

1.00 Apologies

Apologies were received from: Cllr. Brent Carter, Cllr. Dave Hardacre, Mrs Mary Bradley, , Mr Stephen Tillman, Mr Ron Yandle, John Harrison, Laura Owen, Tony Rogers, Mr Bill White

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
2.00	<u>Declaration of Interest</u>	
	None were declared	
3.00	<u>Minutes of the Last Meeting</u>	
3.01	Passed as a true account.	
4.00	<u>Matters Arising</u>	
4.01	Alan Rees asked if it could be noted that there had been no mention in the notes about the payment made by Miller Argent had made to the Council Community Fund which was totalled at £66,603.16 James Poyner said there had since been a further payment paid of £51,786.87	SA
5.00	In relation to item 5 it was asked why this item had been tabled, Norman Davies said that it was put on the agenda to allow an exchange of information and views and those who had declared an interest had not participated in this discussion. This item was only to clarify the haulage of coal by road planning application.	
6.12	Alyson Austin said that she had been misquoted and felt that this point had put her in a bad light and requested that it be removed. Robert Jones said that although he had no objection to this point being removed he said he could not agree that Alyson Austin did not say Miller Argent was not sensitive to the residents. Although the committee agreed there had been a heated debate they did not recall the full extent of the conversation. Alyson Austin and Robert Jones continued to debate this item and it was therefore concluded that this point be further discussed after the meeting along with Sue Allen in attempt to agree on the wording of this point.	RJ AA & SA
6.14	It was asked why had the noise monitor not been moved from Mount View to Bradley Garden, as in the view of some members it would have been better situated at this location. It was pointed out that Mr Yandle had objected to this move. The committee also recalled a discussion had taken place concerning the fact the noise monitor had been placed at Mount View as part of the planning consent. It was also pointed out that the planning consent had specified 4 monitoring areas. The Chair also agreed that no discussion had been made concerning the	

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
	<p>relocation of the noise monitor. Cllr. Williams pointed out that most of the complaints were from one person and if the monitor was only to be moved because of that one person therefore felt it was unjustified in moving the monitor The committee put this to a vote and the motion carried that the monitor stay where it is. Mrs Austin said that she wanted the amendment to be moved again and the vote was 4 in favour and 6 against the removal it was also felt that this motion should not have been voted on until Mr Yandle was present.</p> <p>James Poyner voiced an opinion that it was not up to the Liaison Committee to vote on the removal of the monitor and that the committee was acting "ultra vires" in doing so.</p>	
7.01	<p>Alyson Austin said that she was unhappy with this point as it again projected her in a bad light and took exception to this comment being noted, Robert Jones and Kylie Jones said that they were only commenting on what was actually said and although they would oblige Alyson Austin and agree to this point being re-worded as they were unable to agree on what was actually said the Chair and the committee once again suggested that Robert Jones, Kylie Jones and Sue Allen meet up and agree on the wording that both parties would accept.</p>	<p>RJ, KJ AA & SA</p>
	<p>It was noted that there were only 3 appendix listed at the end of the notes The Environment Health Report had been omitted and should be added to the list.</p>	SA
5.00	Reports	
	<u>Miller Argent – Site Report</u>	
5.01	Mr Robert Jones discussed his report which had been circulated to all committee members ahead of the meeting.	
5.02	It was reported that there were 214 people involved in the project including the D.P.	
5.03	The main haul road out of the box cut was now completed which should help reduce noise levels	

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
5.04	The workshop is now in operation although the wheel wash is not yet complete.	
5.04	The community buses were in great demand and there are over 27 community organisation registered. The committee wished it to be noted that the mini buses offered a fantastic service and were very much appreciated.	
5.05	There were between 4 – 5 archaeologists on site working on pit 4. Archaeological finds included on the south side of the Bogey Road some old brickworks, Liz Verrinder explained that all finds were recorded by hand, drawn and documented and photographed. James Poyner said that Liz could arrange a power point presentation of the photographs if anyone would like to see it. It was agreed that a presentation in the future would be a good idea	

Miller Argent – Environment Report

- 5.06 Kylie Jones said that since the report had been sent out a further 5 complaints had been received made by 3 different people. One from Dowlais had led to the excavation equipment being moved to reduce noise level, the other complaints were from Incline Side and Bradley Gardens, the one from Bradley Gardens complained about the noise, Kylie Jones told the committee that the noise could not have been from the site as it had been rained off early that evening, Alyson Austin added that she may have been wrong about the time and that it may have been earlier than the time reported.
- 5.07 It was reported that some the dump trucks had been fitted with exhaust diverters through a skip which helped reduce the noise level – 5 of the machines had already been fitted and the remainder were to be done soon.
- 5.08 Tests were still being done on “napped” engine and grills
- 5.09 Modified fans had been tested on the excavator and although further experimental ones are being built they are as yet not on site.
- 5.10 Seed collection had been completed.
- 5.11 It was pointed out that retrospective complaints were not

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
	helpful as Miller Argent were unable to investigate or do anything about them.	

Environment Agency

- 5.12 Apologies were given on behalf of Laura Owen and John Reeves had attended instead.

It was reported that there had been no complaints by telephone or letter. Everything had been within the planning consent.

Bargoed Taff diversion needed to be monitored and the Environment Agency had been giving Miller Argent advice, so far all samples taken had been with the consent.

The question was asked if it was possible to record the number of times there had been a Easterly Wind. If it was then it would be helpful if a pie chart could be produced, thus it would enable a comparison to be done with the previous year.

It was felt that the 2 wind monitors 1) Twynyrodyn???? School and 2) Disposal Point would show different results. There was some concern that it would be a lot of work to produce a graph showing wind directions since records commenced, James Poyner said he didn't feel it would be a big job.

MTCBC Environmental Health Department

- 5.13 Zoe Pieris said there had been 5 complaints: 3 noise and 2 dust. She had also received a few informal complaints. She had received 1 complaint on Tuesday from someone on the Parade who she was going to visit and assess the noise; once again Miller Argent had not been informed. Zoe also said she had received 2 letters of protest from St Tydfil Avenue and Dowlais.

6.00 Residents Reports/Concerns

- 6.01 Alyson Austin said that recently it had been great with no

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
-------------	-------------	---------------

noise up until the start of the week.

Alyson Austin asked if Miller Argent could put up a shield/barrier for the lighting sets to stop light shining down towards the town. Robert Jones said that a lighting set inspection had been planned for Monday night he also said that the lights were adjustable with a 360 degree movement. He said he would specifically look at the problem and check these lights out.

7.00 Elected Members Report

Dowlais Ward

7.01 The Chair reported he had received no complaints

Town Ward

7.02 There had been only 1 complaint since May which was more than 2 months ago. Cllr Griffin also said that Penywaun Residents group had mentioned the noise was loud yet no one had complained. He said then when walking the dog he could hear the workings and see the lights.

The question was asked was the noise worse in Dowlais than Bradley Garden as they were in the direct line of sight and yet there had been no noise complaints received from this area.

Robert Jones said that the weather had been against Miller Argent so they had not yet been able to build up the berm to help block the noise and light.

Alyson Austin said that she had to say that tonight she was unable to tell the difference between the noise from the site and the A4060 road.

Plymouth Ward

7.03 Cllr. Williams said that he had received 1 complaint about noise. He lived in Pant and in direct line of the site and what is fascinating is that to one person to another it's an annoyance.

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
-------------	-------------	---------------

It was felt by some members that there was an increase in the noise level and that there should be an official noise monitor located in Bradley Gardens.

Dave Dier said that there had been 1 specific complaint about the increase in noise in Galon Uchaf and would like someone to go out with a noise monitor.

The question was asked about the extra machine that was due on site and would it contribute to the noise. James Poyner said that the machine was not a replacement but brought in to catch up on lost production.

8.00 **Correspondence Received**

8.01 No relevant correspondence received.

9.00 **Any Other Business**

9.01 James Poyner said that Miller Argent had been served with a pre-action protocol letter advising of an application for yet a further Judicial Review. This had been served by a group calling themselves Ffos-y-fran Residents group. They were taking action against Caerphilly County Borough Council, and Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council. Miller Argent is an "interested party" in this case.

He pointed out that although Miller Argent had written to the other side solicitors enquiring after the names of the residents forming the group.

Alyson Austin asked that it be noted that she was not aware of this action and didn't know anything about it and was not part of this action group.

Several of the committee were unaware and surprised about this action, also expressing their concern about this action declaring it a waste of public money.

There followed a discussion about this action and the Chair suggested drawing a line under this discussion and conclude the meeting.

<u>Item</u>	<u>Note</u>	<u>Action</u>
-------------	-------------	---------------

10.00	<u>Date of Next Meeting</u>	
--------------	------------------------------------	--

- | | | |
|------|--|--|
| 10.1 | The date of the next meeting is Thursday 27 th November 2008. The meeting is to be held at the Civic Centre, Merthyr Tydfil and due to the dark evenings is to start at 6.00 p.m. | |
| 10.2 | There being no further business the Cllr. Amos thanked everyone for their attendance and closed the meeting. | |

Appendices

1. Site Progress Report – Robert Jones
2. Environmental Report – Kylie Jones
3. Environment Agency's Report

CONTACT NUMBERS

Miller Argent – Contact Details

Emergency Contact Number	0800 988 8444
Telephone during office hours	0870 111 5600
Web Site	www.millerargent.co.uk
e-mail	maadmin@millerargent.co.uk